

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|----------------|----|
| Dedication | i |
| Acknowledgment | ii |
| Abbreviations | iv |

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

| | |
|---|---|
| A. Purpose and Goal of the Research | 1 |
| B. The Status Quaestionis – Previous Research on this Topic | 4 |
| C. Methodology | 5 |
| D. Structural Set-up of the Work | 5 |

CHAPTER ONE

THE NOTION OF CONTRACTS IN GENERAL

| | |
|--|----|
| Introduction | 7 |
| I. Unravelling the Terminological Semantics | 7 |
| A. 'Contractus' in Legislative Texts | 7 |
| B. 'Conventio' in Legislative Texts | 8 |
| C. Contract or/and Agreement | 8 |
| 1. Understanding the Notion of Contract | 8 |
| 2. A Broad and Limited Understanding of the Notion of Contract | 11 |
| 2.1. A Broad Understanding of the Notion of Contract | 11 |
| 2.2. A strict Understanding of the Notion of Contract | 12 |
| 3. The Term Agreement | 12 |
| II. Types of Contracts | 15 |
| A. Unilateral and Co-performance (Sinallagmatici) Contracts | 15 |
| B. Consensual and Real Contracts | 16 |
| C. Gratuitous and Onerous Contract | 16 |
| D. Constitutive, Amending and Extinctive Contracts | 17 |
| E. An Overview of the Types of Contracts | 17 |
| III. The Form of a Contract | 18 |
| IV. Contracts and Juridic Acts | 20 |

| | |
|---|----|
| A. Relationship between the Juridic Act and the Legal Transaction | 20 |
| B. Different Kinds of Juridic Acts | 21 |
| C. Committing Juridic Acts in Writing | 22 |
| Conclusion | 23 |

CHAPTER TWO

NORMS ON CONTRACT IN ECCLESIASTICAL LAW: LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

| | |
|---|----|
| Introduction | 25 |
| I. Pre-1917 Codification | 25 |
| A. Remote and Proximate Settings | 25 |
| 1. Contracts in General | 26 |
| 2. Dioceses and Religious Institutes | 28 |
| 2.1. The Power of the Religious to Contract | 28 |
| 2.2. Relationship between Bishops and Religious | 29 |
| B. Appraisal of the Pre-Codification Era | 31 |
| II. CIC/ 1917 | 32 |
| A. Norms on Agreements and Contracts | 32 |
| 1. Norms on Agreements | 32 |
| 2. Norms on Contracts | 33 |
| B. Further Considerations | 34 |
| III. The Eastern Catholic Church before Vatican II | 35 |
| A. Motu Proprio: Postquam Apostolicis (PA) | 35 |
| B. Motu Proprio: Cleri Sanctitati (CS) | 36 |
| C. Concluding Remarks | 37 |
| IV. The Second Vatican Council | 37 |
| A. Preparation for the Council: The Ante-Preparatory and Preparatory Phases | 37 |
| 1. Contracts and Agreements as per Work in Commissions | 38 |
| 2. Observations | 40 |
| B. Conciliar and Post-Conciliar Documents | 41 |
| 1. The Conciliar Documents | 42 |

| | |
|---|----|
| 1.1. Christus Dominus (CD): Decree on the Pastoral Ministry of Bishops | 42 |
| 1.2. Perfectae Caritatis (PC): On the Adaptation and Renewal of Religious Life | 43 |
| 1.3. Ad Gentes (AG): On the Missionary Activities of the Church | 43 |
| 1.4. Concluding Remarks | 44 |
| 2. Post Conciliar Documents | 46 |
| 2.1. Ecclesiae Sanctae (ES) | 46 |
| 2.1.1. Relationship between Bishops and Religious Institutes | 46 |
| 2.1.2. On the Equal Distribution of Priests | 48 |
| 2.1.3. Relationship between Local Ordinaries and Missionary Institutes. | 49 |
| 2.1.4. Concluding Remarks | 49 |
| 2.2. Relationes in Territoriis (RIT) | 50 |
| 2.3. Mutuae Relationes (MR) | 52 |
| 2.3.1. Juridic Nature of MR | 52 |
| 2.3.2. Provisions contained in MR | 53 |
| 2.4. Concluding Remarks | 54 |
| V. Codex Iuris Canonici – CIC/1983: Revision Exercise | 55 |
| A. Preparatory Phase | 56 |
| B. Schemata on Contracts and Agreements | 58 |
| 1. Schema on the People of God | 59 |
| 1.1. On Fidei Donum Priests - C. 271 | 59 |
| 1.2. On The Entrustment of Parishes to Religious Institutes | - |
| C. 520 | 61 |
| 2. Schema on the Consecrated Life: Entrustment of Diocesan Works to Religious – C. 681. | 63 |
| 3. Schema on the Church’s Teaching Mission – C. 790 | 65 |
| 4. Schema on Temporalities (De Iure Patrimoniali Ecclesiae) | - |
| C. 1290 | 67 |
| Conclusion | 68 |

CHAPTER THREE
NORMS ON CONTRACT IN ECCLESIASTICAL LAW:
PRESENT FORMULATIONS

| | |
|---|----|
| Introduction | 71 |
| I. Codex Iuris Canonici (CIC/1983) | 72 |
| A. Contracts between Specific Ecclesiastical Entities | 72 |
| 1. C. 271: Fidei Donum Priests | 72 |
| 2. C. 520 §2: Entrustment of Parishes to Religious | 73 |
| 3. C. 681: Entrustment of Diocesan Works | 75 |
| 4. C. 790: Apostolates in Missionary Territories | 75 |
| 5. Concluding Remarks | 78 |
| B. Contracts Involving Unspecified Parties | 79 |
| 1. Norms Directly Related to Contracts | 79 |
| 1.1. C. 192: Removal from Ecclesiastical Office | 80 |
| 1.2. C. 639: Incurring Debts and Obligations | 80 |
| 1.3. C. 1190: Sales of Sacred Relics | 82 |
| 1.4. Cc. 1291 – 1297: Alienation | 83 |
| 1.5. C. 1715: Extra-Judicial Settlements | 83 |
| 2. Norms Indirectly Related to Contracts | 84 |
| 3. Concluding Remarks | 85 |
| C. Canon 1290: Contracts in General | 85 |
| 1. An Understanding of the Concept of “Canonisation of Civil Law” | 86 |
| 2. Interpretation of c. 1290 | 87 |
| 2.1. Strict Interpretation | 87 |
| 2.2. A Broader Interpretation | 88 |
| 3. An Understanding of some Juridic Elements Contained in this Norm | 89 |
| 3.1. De Contractus “tam in Genere quam in specie” | 90 |
| 3.2. “De Solutionibus” | 91 |
| 3.3. “Quoad res potestati regiminis Ecclesiae subiectas” | 93 |
| 4. The Restrictive Clauses | 95 |
| 4.1. “Nisi Iuri Divino Contraria Sint” | 95 |

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| 4.2. | “Aliud Iure Canónico Caveatur” | 97 |
| 4.3. | “Et firmo praescripto can. 1547” | 98 |
| 5. | Concluding Remarks | 99 |
| II. | CCEO/1990 on Contracts and Agreements | 100 |
| A. | Revision of the Eastern Code | 100 |
| 1. | Preparatory Phase and Procedures | 100 |
| 2. | Norms on Contract and Agreement | 102 |
| B. | Comparative Analysis: Distinctions and Purposes | 103 |
| 1. | Fidei Donum Priests | 103 |
| 2. | Entrustment of Parishes | 103 |
| 3. | Entrustment of Eparchial Works to Religious | 104 |
| 4. | Contracts in General | 105 |
| 5. | Mutual Agreement for the Formation of Clerics | 105 |
| | Conclusion | 106 |

CHAPTER FOUR

THE ELEMENTS OF A CONTRACT

| | | |
|--------|---|-----|
| | Introduction | 107 |
| I. | The Parties to a Contract | 108 |
| A. | The Principal Parties to a Contract | 109 |
| 1. | Juridic Status of the Parties to a Contract | 109 |
| 1.1. | C. 1290 on Ecclesiastical Entities and their Juridic Status | 109 |
| 1.1.1. | Ecclesiastical Entities in Canon Law | 109 |
| 1.1.2. | Juridic Status According to Secular and Canon Law | 110 |
| 1.2. | Coincidence of Canonical Status with Civil Status | 113 |
| 1.3. | Incongruity between Canonical and Civil Statuses | 114 |
| 1.3.1. | The Case of Dissonance | 115 |
| 1.3.2. | The Stratified Representation | 118 |
| 1.4. | Non-Legal Status | 119 |
| 1.5. | The Case of Cameroon | 119 |
| 1.5.1. | The Procurement of Civil Juridic Status | 120 |
| a. | Procurement Based on the Framework Agreement | 120 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| b. Alternative Criteria for Procurement of Juridic Status | 122 |
| 1.5.2. Relationship among Ecclesiastical Entities | 124 |
| 1.6. Concluding Remarks | 125 |
| 2. Consequences of the Distinctions of Canonical Statuses on Contractual Relationships | 126 |
| 2.1. Coincidence of Canonical Status with Civil Status | 126 |
| 2.2. Incongruity between Canonical and Civil Status | 127 |
| 2.2.1. The Case of Dissonance | 127 |
| 2.2.2. The Stratified Representation | 127 |
| 2.3. Non legal Status | 128 |
| 2.4. Concluding Remarks | 128 |
| 3. Change in Status of a Party to a Contract and Its Legal Implications | 128 |
| 3.1. Division of Ecclesiastical Entities | 129 |
| 3.2. Amalgamation of Ecclesiastical Entities | 129 |
| 3.3. The Extinction of an Ecclesiastical Entity | 131 |
| 4. The Legal Implications of the Change of Canonical Status in Contractual Relationships | 132 |
| 4.1. Division of Ecclesiastical Entities | 133 |
| 4.2. Amalgamation of Ecclesiastical Entities | 134 |
| 4.3. The Extinction of an Ecclesiastical Entity | 135 |
| 5. Concluding Remarks | 136 |
| B. Third Parties to a Contract | 136 |
| 1. Expounding the Notion of Third Parties | 136 |
| 2. Civil law Jurisprudence and Legislation on Third Parties | 138 |
| 3. Third Parties to a Contract According to Ecclesiastical Law | 141 |
| 4. Concluding Remarks | 143 |
| II. Consensus, Causa, <i>l'Objet</i> and Consideration | 143 |
| A. Consensus | 144 |
| 1. The Two-Sided Components of Consent | 145 |
| 2. The Manifestation of Consent | 145 |
| 2.1. Explicit Manifestation of Consent | 146 |
| 2.2. Implicit Manifestation of Consent | 146 |

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| B. | The Purpose of the Contract – Causa Pacti | 147 |
| 1. | ‘Causa’ in Legal Parlance | 148 |
| 2. | Causa in the Secular Law Systems | 149 |
| 2.1. | As per Scholarly Opinions | 149 |
| 2.2. | Causa of a Contract in Civil Legislation | 149 |
| 3. | Causa in the Ecclesiastical Legal System | 151 |
| 3.1. | The Attempt at a Canonical Definition | 151 |
| 3.2. | “Causa Pacti” According to the Code of Canon Law | 151 |
| C. | Consideration in Common Law | 152 |
| D. | Residual Elements of a Contract | 154 |
| III. | Ecclesiastical law Concerning the Contents of the Contract | 154 |
| A. | Relationship between Bishops and Religious | 155 |
| B. | Relationship between Other Ecclesiastical Entities | 157 |
| | Conclusion | 157 |

CHAPTER FIVE

PROCEDURAL QUESTIONS: TOWARDS THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A CONTRACT

| | | |
|--------|---|-----|
| | Introduction | 159 |
| I. | Secular Law Procedures | 160 |
| A. | Offer: Understanding, Communication and Termination of Offer | 160 |
| 1. | Offer: Understanding and Communication | 160 |
| 2. | Termination of Offer | 162 |
| B. | Acceptance: Understanding and Communication | 163 |
| 1. | Understanding the Notion of Acceptance | 163 |
| 2. | Communication of Acceptance | 165 |
| C. | Concluding Remarks | 166 |
| II. | Canon Law Procedures | 166 |
| A. | The Bargaining Process, General Principles | 167 |
| 1. | Between the Legal Representation of the Ecclesiastical Entities – the Principal Parties | 167 |
| 1.1. | Under Ordinary Circumstances | 167 |
| 1.1.1. | The Question of Competence | 167 |

| | | |
|---------|--|-----|
| a. | Competence in General | 167 |
| b. | Concluding a Contract in the Name or with the Power of Another | 168 |
| i. | Forms of Designation | 168 |
| i.i. | The Vicarious Power | 168 |
| i.ii. | The Procuration | 169 |
| i.iii. | Delegation of powers - potestas delegata | 169 |
| i.iv. | The Special Mandate | 170 |
| ii. | The Exercise of the Power of Designation | 171 |
| ii.i. | By Means of an act of Delegation | 171 |
| ii.ii. | Through Vicarious Powers | 173 |
| ii.iii. | Through Procuration | 174 |
| ii.iv. | Through a Special Mandate | 174 |
| 1.1.2. | The Placement of the Juridic Act | 175 |
| 1.2. | Under Extra-ordinary Circumstances | 177 |
| 1.2.1. | Non-Conformity of Status | 177 |
| a. | The Case of Dissonance | 178 |
| b. | The Stratified Representation | 179 |
| c. | Non Legal Status | 180 |
| 1.2.2. | Change of Canonical Status | 181 |
| 2. | Persons Implicated in the Contract | 182 |
| 2.1. | Normative Sources | 183 |
| 2.1.1. | Iure statuatur | 183 |
| 2.1.2. | Superiores | 184 |
| 2.1.3. | Collegii vel personarum coetus | 185 |
| 2.2. | Practical Modalities | 185 |
| 3. | Third Party Beneficiaries | 188 |
| 4. | Concluding Remarks | 190 |
| B. | Between Dioceses and Religious Institutes | 190 |
| 1. | Preliminary Notes (Report from Field Work) | 190 |
| 2. | Principles for Establishing a Contractual Relationship | 194 |
| 2.1. | Principal Parties | 194 |

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| 2.1.1. | Entrustment of Works to Religious Institutes | 195 |
| a. | C. 520: Entrustment of Parishes | 195 |
| b. | C. 790: Entrustment of Works in Mission Territories | 197 |
| 2.1.2. | Entrustment of Works to Individual Religious | 198 |
| a. | Contextualising the Topic | 198 |
| b. | The Status of a Religious in the Making of a Contract | 199 |
| 2.2. | Persons Implicated in the Contract | 200 |
| 2.2.1. | Those to be Consulted | 200 |
| 2.2.2. | Approval by Superior or Hierarchy | 201 |
| 2.2.3. | Persons with Interests: Contract Execution and/or Benefactor | 202 |
| a. | The Contract Executor | 202 |
| b. | The Benefactor and Founder | 204 |
| 2.2.4. | Third Party Beneficiaries | 205 |
| 3. | Practical Modalities | 205 |
| Conclusion | | 207 |

CHAPTER SIX

RESOLVING CONTRACTUAL CONTROVERSIES

| | | |
|--------------|--|-----|
| Introduction | | 209 |
| I. | Reasons for Controversies | 209 |
| A. | In General: The Identity Problem: Civil and Canonical Statuses | 209 |
| B. | Between Dioceses and Religious Institutes | 210 |
| 1. | Deficiency in Core Value Perception | 210 |
| 2. | When Opportunities Become Sources of Conflict | 210 |
| 3. | Disputes over Properties and Works | 211 |
| 4. | Unresolved Historical Issues | 213 |
| II. | Types of Controversies Related to Contracts | 215 |
| A. | Problems Regarding the Validity of Contracts | 215 |
| 1. | Contracts Invalid in Civil Law and in Canon Law | 215 |
| 1.1. | Invalidity under Ecclesiastical Law | 215 |
| 1.1.1. | Incapacity of Party | 215 |

| | | |
|--------|---|-----|
| 1.1.2. | Defect of Consent | 216 |
| 1.1.3. | Non Observance of Procedure | 216 |
| 1.2. | Invalidity in Secular Law Systems | 218 |
| 1.3. | The Implication of Being in a State of Double Invalidity | 219 |
| 2. | Contracts Valid in Civil Law, but Invalid in Canon Law | 219 |
| 3. | Contracts Valid in Canon Law but Invalid in Civil Law | 220 |
| B. | Problems Regarding the Interpretation of a Contract | 220 |
| 1. | Change of Administrator (Juridic Representation) of the Ecclesiastical Entity | 220 |
| 2. | Dealing with Unforeseen Situations | 221 |
| 2.1. | Change of the Circumstances Within Which a Contract was Established | 221 |
| 2.2. | Unforeseen Incidents | 222 |
| 3. | The Role of Associated Actors | 223 |
| C. | Problems Regarding the Performance of Contractual Obligations | 223 |
| 1. | Breach of Contract | 223 |
| 2. | Administrative Offences | 224 |
| 3. | Change in Circumstances of the Contract | 225 |
| 4. | Concluding Remarks | 225 |
| III. | Resolution of Contract-based Conflicts and Controversies | 226 |
| A. | Scripture-Based and Alternative Dispute Resolution Remedies | 226 |
| 1. | Scripture-Based Remedies | 226 |
| 2. | The Alternative Dispute Resolution: Arbitration and Conciliation | 227 |
| 2.1. | Historical Background and Context of the ADR | 227 |
| 2.1.1. | From the Perspective of Secular Law | 227 |
| 2.1.2. | From the Perspective of Ecclesiastical Law | 229 |
| 2.2. | Applicability and Functionality of the ADR: Conciliation and Arbitration | 230 |
| B. | Access to Legal Remedies | 234 |
| 1. | Legal Remedies in Canon Law | 234 |
| 1.1. | The Ordinary Tribunals of the Church | 234 |
| 1.1.1. | The Competent Forum | 234 |
| 1.1.2. | The Process of Adjudication | 235 |

| | | |
|--------|--|-----|
| 1.2. | Processes Against Administrative Acts | 236 |
| 1.2.1. | Hierarchical Recourse | 237 |
| 1.2.2. | Administrative Tribunals | 238 |
| 2. | Legal Remedies Based on the Civil Law System | 238 |
| 2.1. | From a Global Perspective | 239 |
| 2.2. | The Case of Cameroon | 239 |
| 2.2.1. | The ADR in the Cameroon Context | 239 |
| 2.2.2. | Access to Judicial Procedure | 241 |
| C. | An Appraisal of the Processes (Merits and Demerits) | 242 |
| 1. | The ADR Models | 242 |
| 1.1. | From a Global Perspective | 242 |
| 1.1.1. | A Positive Appraisal | 242 |
| 1.1.2. | Common Challenges Associated with the ADR | 243 |
| 1.2. | The Cameroon Experience | 244 |
| 1.2.1. | At The Level of the Ecclesial Community | 244 |
| 1.2.2. | With Regard to Secular Law | 244 |
| 2. | The Legal Remedies | 246 |
| 2.1. | The Ordinary Tribunals | 246 |
| 2.2. | Processes Against Administrative Acts: The Hierarchical Recourse and the Administrative Tribunal | 248 |
| 3. | Procedures Envisaged in Civil Law | 249 |
| 4. | Concluding Remarks | 250 |
| IV. | A Closer Examination of the Controversies | 251 |
| A. | Problems Regarding the Validity of Contracts | 252 |
| 1. | Contracts Invalid in Civil Law and in Canon Law | 252 |
| 1.1. | Invalidity in Canon Law: Consequence(s) and Remedies | 252 |
| 1.2. | Invalidity in Civil Law: Consequences and Remedies | 253 |
| 1.3. | The Dual Status of Invalidity and the Way Forward | 254 |
| 2. | Contracts Valid in Civil Law, but Invalid in Canon Law | 255 |
| B. | Problems Regarding the Interpretation of a Contract | 257 |
| C. | Problems Regarding the Performance of Contractual Obligations | 259 |
| 1. | Breach of Contract | 259 |

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| 2. | Administrative Offences | 260 |
| 2.1. | Administrative Offences in General | 260 |
| 2.2. | Administrative Offences by Clerics and Religious | 261 |
| V. | A Brief Note on Canon Law Jurisprudence and Equity | 262 |
| A. | Canon Law Jurisprudence | 262 |
| B. | Canonical Equity | 262 |
| | Conclusion | 264 |

GENERAL CONCLUSION

| | | |
|----|--|-----|
| A. | Contracts, Ecclesiastical Entities and Canon Law | 266 |
| 1. | Contracts as Juridic Acts | 267 |
| 2. | The Canonical Status of Ecclesiastical Entities | 267 |
| 3. | Dioceses and Religious Institutes | 268 |
| B. | Contracts, the Ecclesiastical Entity and Civil Law | 269 |
| 1. | Juridic Status Within Civil Legislation | 269 |
| 2. | Consequences of the Juridic Status to Contractual Capacity | 269 |
| C. | Resolution of Conflicts | 270 |
| D. | Final Remarks | 272 |

APPENDIX

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| I. | Grant of Civil Legal Personality of the Diocese of Kumbo | 274 |
| II. | Authorisation for the Creation and Opening of Catholic Health Centre, Tabenken | 275 |
| III. | Questionnaire – English | 276 |
| IV. | Questionnaire – French | 281 |

| | | |
|--|--------------|-----|
| | BIBLIOGRAPHY | 286 |
|--|--------------|-----|